BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

)))

)

)

IN THE MATTER OF:
WATER QUALITY STANDARDS AND
EFFLUENT LIMITATIONS FOR THE
CHICAGO AREA WATERWAY SYSTEM
AND THE LOWER DES PLAINES RIVER:
PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO 35 III.
Adm. Code Parts 301, 302, 303 and 304

R08-9 (Rulemaking – Water)

NOTICE OF FILING

TO: See Attached Service List

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on the 3rd day of February, 2010, I filed with the Office of the Clerk of the Illinois Pollution Control Board the attached Reply in Opposition to the Motions to Stay Proceedings and Seeking Hearings on the Impact of Asian Carp Litigation Before the United States Supreme Court by the People of the State of Illinois, a copy of which is hereby served upon you.

Respectfully submitted,

LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois

By:

Susan Hedman Environmental Counsel (312) 814-4947

Andrew Armstrong Assistant Attorney General (312) 814-0660

Environmental Division 69 West Washington Street, Suite 1800 Chicago, Illinois 60602 (312) 814-4947

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF:

WATER QUALITY STANDARDS AND EFFLUENT LIMITATIONS FOR THE CHICAGO AREA WATERWAY SYSTEM AND THE LOWER DES PLAINES RIVER: PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO 35 III. Adm. Code Parts 301, 302, 303 and 304 R08-9 (Rulemaking – Water)

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS' REPLY IN OPPOSITION TO THE MOTIONS TO STAY PROCEEDINGS AND SEEKING HEARINGS ON THE IMPACT OF ASIAN CARP LITIGATION BEFORE THE UNITED STATES SUPREME COURT

The People of the State of Illinois ("the People"), by and through Illinois Attorney General Lisa Madigan, oppose the motions of several regulated parties seeking Board hearings on the Asian carp litigation pending before the United States Supreme Court and the extent to which the presence of Asian carp in Illinois waterways "could" (*e.g.*, MWRDGC Resp. at 1) or "might" (*e.g.*, Stepan Resp. at 4) affect attainable uses or appropriate water quality standards for the CAWS and Lower Des Plaines. In the alternative, some of these parties seek to "defer" all or a portion of this rulemaking proceeding. (*e.g.*, Lemont Refinery Reply at 1.)

The motions should be denied. A hearing on the Asian carp issue would be at best premature and, at worst, improper. The People also oppose any stay of this rulemaking proceeding, which has already been delayed too long.

The proposed hearing would be premature because, as the People and MWRDGC point out in their responses to the motions, Asian carp issues are currently the subject of litigation before the United States Supreme Court in which the State of Illinois and MWRDGC are named

parties. In addition, several Federal, State, and local agencies—including the State of Illinois and MWRDGC—are actively working to develop a strategy to address the Asian carp problem. (MWRDGC Resp. at 2-3.) At this point, no one can predict the result of the Supreme Court litigation or the strategy that will be selected through the intergovernmental process. Moreover, no one can predict what effect, if any, those as yet unknown outcomes might have on the attainable uses and appropriate water quality standards that are the proper subject of this rulemaking proceeding. In the face of this uncertainty, a hearing would not be productive.

The proposed hearing would be improper, because of the potential to interfere with ongoing litigation before the United States Supreme Court. As noted in the People's response, it would be highly irregular and quite inappropriate for a State agency to hold a hearing to consider the impacts that would occur if the United States Supreme Court were to rule against the State of Illinois. At this point in time, the State of Illinois should be—and is—focused on the task of defending the State before the Supreme Court.

The People also oppose any stay of this rulemaking proceeding. There are many issues before the Board in this docket on which Asian carp could have no conceivable impact. For example, none of the hypothetical scenarios advanced by the regulated parties would provide any basis for a lower level of disinfection than the Illinois EPA proposal would require for the MWRDGC's North Side treatment plant. Movants appear to have lost sight of the fact that this proceeding is a statutorily-mandated (and long-overdue) review of scientific evidence to establish water quality standards, not a perpetual fact-finding mission to investigate any and all issues that could potentially affect Illinois' waterways.

2

WHEREFORE, for all of the reasons stated herein, the People respectfully request that the Board deny the motions seeking a hearing on Asian carp issues and the motions seeking to stay this proceeding.

> LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois

By:

Hal

Susan Hedman Environmental Counsel (312) 814-4947

Andrew Armstrong Assistant Attorney General (312) 814-0660

Environmental Division 69 West Washington Street, Suite 1800 Chicago, Illinois 60602 (312) 814-4947

DATE: February 3, 2010

<u>CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE</u>

I, ANDREW ARMSTRONG, do certify that I filed electronically with the Office of the Clerk of the Illinois Pollution Control Board the foregoing Notice of Filing and Reply in Opposition to the Motions to Stay Proceedings and Seeking Hearings on the Impact of Asian Carp Litigation Before the United States Supreme Court by the People of the State of Illinois and caused them to be served this 3rd day of February, 2010 upon the persons listed on the attached Service List by depositing true and correct copies of same in an envelope, first class postage prepaid, with the United States Postal Service at 69 West Washington Street, Chicago, Illinois, unless otherwise noted on the Service List.

In chew Austron ANDREW ARMSTRONG

SERVICE LIST R08-9

John T. Therriault Assistant Clerk of the Board Illinois Pollution Control Board 100 West Randolph Street Suite 11-500 Chicago, Illinois 60601 [by electronic mail]

Marie E. Tipsord Hearing Officer Illinois Pollution Control Board 100 West Randolph Street Suite 11-500 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Deborah J. Williams Stefanie N. Diers Illinois EPA 1021 North Grand Avenue East Post Office Box 19276 Springfield, Illinois 62794-9276

Frederick M. Feldman Ronald M. Hill Louis Kollias Margaret T. Conway Metropolitan Water Reclamation District 100 East Erie Street Chicago, Illinois 60611

Roy M. Harsch Drinker Biddle & Reath 191 North Wacker Drive Suite 3700 Chicago, Illinois 60606-1698

Claire A. Manning Brown, Hay & Stephens LLP 700 First Mercantile Bank Building 205 South Fifth Street Post Office Box 2459 Springfield, Illinois 62705-2459 Kevin G. Desharnais Thomas W. Dimond Thomas V. Skinner Jennifer A. Simon Mayer, Brown LLP 71 South Wacker Drive Chicago, Illinois 60606-4637

Robert VanGyseghem City of Geneva 1800 South Street Geneva, Illinois 60134-2203

Cindy Skrukrud Jerry Paulsen McHenry County Defenders 132 Cass Street Woodstock, Illinois 60098

Bernard Sawyer Thomas Granto Metropolitan Water Reclamation District 6001 West Pershing Road Cicero, Illinois 60650-4112

Lisa Frede Chemical Industry Council of Illinois 1400 East Touhy Avenue Suite 100 Des Plaines, Illinois 60019-3338

Fredric P. Andes Erika K. Powers Barnes & Thornburg LLP 1 North Wacker Drive Suite 4400 Chicago, Illinois 60606

James L. Daugherty Thorn Creek Basin Sanitary District 700 West End Avenue Chicago Heights, Illinois 60411

Tracy Elzemeyer American Water Company 727 Craig Road St. Louis, Missouri 63141

Keith I. Harley Elizabeth Schenkier Chicago Legal Clinic, Inc. 205 West Monroe Street Fourth Floor Chicago, Illinois 60606

Frederick D. Keady, P.E. Vermillion Coal Company 1979 Johns Drive Glenview, Illinois 60025

Mark Schultz Navy Facilities and Engineering Command 201 Decatur Avenue Building 1A Great Lakes, Illinois 60088-2801

W.C. Blanton Husch Blackwell Sanders LLP 4801 Main Street Suite 1000 Kansas City, Missouri 64112

James E. Eggen City of Joliet, Department of Public Work and Utilities 921 East Washington Street Joliet, Illinois 60431

Kay Anderson American Bottoms RWTF One American Bottoms Road Sauget, Illinois 62201

Jack Darin Sierra Club 70 East Lake Street Suite 1500 Chicago, Illinois 60601-7447 Bob Carter Bloomington Normal Water Reclamation District Post Office Box 3307 Bloomington, Illinois 61702-3307

Tom Muth Fox Metro Water Reclamation District 682 State Route 31 Oswego, Illinois 60543

Kenneth W. Liss Andrews Environmental Engineering 3300 Ginger Creek Drive Springfield, Illinois 62711

Albert Ettinger Jessica Dexter Environmental Law & Policy Center 35 East Wacker Suite 1300 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Vicky McKinley Evanston Environment Board 223 Grey Avenue Evanston, Illinois 60202

Marc Miller Jamie S. Caston Office of Governor Pat Quinn Room 414 State House Springfield, Illinois 62706

Susan M. Franzetti Franzetti Law Firm P.C. 10 South LaSalle Street Suite 3600 Chicago, Illinois 60603

Irwin Polls Ecological Monitoring and Assessment 3206 Maple Leaf Drive Glenview, Illinois 60025

Dr. Thomas J. Murphy 2325 North Clifton Street Chicago, Illinois 60614

Cathy Hudzik City of Chicago-Mayor's Office of Intergovernmental Affairs 121 North LaSalle Street City Hall - Room 406 Chicago, Illinois 60602

Beth Steinhour 2021 Timberbrook Springfield, Illinois 62702

James Huff Huff & Huff, Inc. 915 Harger Road Suite 330 Oak Brook, Illinois 60523

Ann Alexander Natural Resources Defense Council 2 North Riverside Plaza Floor 23 Chicago, Illinois 60606

Traci Barkley Prairie Rivers Network 1902 Fox Drive Suite 6 Champaign, Illinois 61820

Jeffrey C. Fort Ariel J. Tesher Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 233 South Wacker Drive Suite 7800 Chicago, Illinois 60606-6404

Kristy A. N. Bulleit Hunton & Williams LLC 1900 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20006 Lyman C. Welch Manager, Water Quality Programs Alliance for the Great Lakes 17 North State Street Suite 1390 Chicago, Illinois 60602

Stacy Meyers-Glen Openlands 25 East Washington Street Suite 1650 Chicago, Illinois 60602

Alec M. Davis Katherine D. Hodge Matthew C. Read Monica T. Rios N. LaDonna Driver Hodge Dwyer Zeman 3150 Roland Avenue Post Office Box 5776 Springfield, Illinois 62705-5776